Review Report of COAST Trust

March 2010

Undertaken by Dr. Omar F Chowdhury and Ms Farida Easmin on behalf of Coastal Organisation for Social Transformation (COAST Trust)

The Team

This review was undertaken by Dr. Omar F Chowdhury and Ms. Farida Easmin . COAST Trust invited Dr. Omar Chowdhury and Ms Easmin to conduct the review of both programme and management of the COAST Trust. Mr. Emdadul Haque Bhuiyan , Associate Consultant accompanied the team to Cox's Bazar in order to carry out the activities in time .

Acknowledgement

We would like to thank the Board of Trustees of COAST for appointing us to conduct the review. We deeply acknowledged and appreciate the support and guidance provided by Mr. Rezaul Karim Chowdhury, Executive Director of COAST.

Our heartfelt thanks to all staff at the head office, regional offices and the field level staff who were involved in the study for their participation and generosity with time, information and access to their documents and programmes. Particular thanks are due to beneficiaries, UP Chairperson, members, member of POs, group members and community people and support staff at all levels for their support during the field visits. Without their assistance it would not have been possible to undertake such a comprehensive study or have met so many people within very short time.

Thanks are due to Mr. Aminul Hoque who accompanied us to project sites and all project staff and other support staff who have provided their fullest support to the review team in carrying out the task.

Responsibility

This study was commissioned by the Board of Trustee (BoT) of COAST Trust. Though the study was conducted as a participative exercise, it was the responsibility of the consultants and this report and the views and recommendations contained within it are those of the consultants and are not necessarily those of COAST Trust. The COAST Trust does not bear any responsibility for the views expressed in this report.

Abbreviation

BOT : Board of Trustee

COAST : Coastal Organisation for Social Transformation

CBO : Community based Organisation

ED : Executive Director

FGDs : Focus Group Discussion

GOB : Government of Bangladesh

HCP : Hard Core Poor HR : Human Rights

KII : Key Informants Interview

LEB : Local Elected Bodies

PKSF : Polli Karma Sahayak Foundation

RTI : Right to information

ToR : Terms of Reference

TOT : Training of Trainer

UNO : Upazila Nirbahi Officer

UP : Union Parishad

VAW : Violence Against Women

Table of Contents

	eam	
Ackno	owledgement	2
Respo	onsibility	2
Abbre	viation	3
Table	of Contents	4
	ıtive Summary	
	ajor Findings and Recommendations	
	onclusion	
Revie	w Report of COAST	٠ ۶
	ter-l	
	Background	
2.	Institutional issues	
	Mission statement	
	Core Values	
3.	Major Programmes/ Projects of COAST	
	Types of beneficiaries, Needs and services provided by COAST	
	Economic Justice Programme	
	IGA activities	
	Micro Finance Technical Support Project (MFTSP)	
3.2.5	Support loans	. 12
	Support Income Generating Activities as SIDR rehabilitation part	
4.	Social Justice Programme	
	Facilitate free & fair election in preparing national ID card & good governance	
5.	Building Capacities for Human Rights Activism: Integration of Sustainable Governance	
5. 1.	Jano Sangathan /People's Organisation(PO)	
6.	Education Programme	
7.	The Vulnerable Group Development (VGD) Programme	.19
8.	Integration of Sustainable Health (Preventive health care for the remote areas)	.19
9.	Reorganization: consolidation of working area, intervention demand and supply side	. 19
10.	SHOUHARDO (Strengthening Household Ability to Respond Development Opportunity)	
11.	Promoting Sustainable Coastal Aquaculture in Bangladesh (ProSCAB) Project	
12	CREP (COAST Renewable Energy Project)	
13.	Partnership with ASF (Acid Survivors Foundation)	20
14.	EquityBD	2
15.	Objective of the Review	2
16.	Methodology of review	
17.	Rationale of using different methodologies	22
18.	Study areas	22
Chap	ter-II	. 24
	rsis of the Findings and Recommendations	
1	Introductory note	. 24
2	Major findings and recommendations	.24
	Institutional issues	
2.2	Policies /procedures / systems/ Staff knowledge and capacity	.25
	Monitoring and Evaluation	
	Economic Justice Programme	
3.1.	Support loan and disaster	.28
4.	Social Justice Programme	.29
	People's Organisation	
4.2.	"Model UP" (Strengthen Local Government) under MJF funded project	.31
4.3.	SANGLAP	.32
	Observation of COAST programme on gender perspective	
	Gender policy	
	Gender Concept	
	Gender and MDG	
	Gender Training and Training Manual	
	Best Practice	
	Conclusion	
	K- A : Case study	
	K- B Schedule of COAST Review	
	K-C: Work Sheet used for conducting Exercise with Coast Staff	
AHHE	K-O. VVOIN SHEEL USED TO CONDUCTING EXERCISE WITH COAST STAIL	. აბ

Executive Summary

- This is the review report of the COAST Trust. The two members team was commissioned by the Board of Trustee (BoT) of COAST to review the COAST management and programmes from the last review up to 2009.. The prime objective of this assessment was to assess the impact of different development program along with future challenge and opportunities for the organization that will create a pave of uniqueness in development field.
- 2. The transformation of COAST from Action Aid project takes place in January 1998. Since then COAST has been growing not only in size but also in undertaking innovative programmes for the benefit of the poorest people of coastal areas as well as policy issues that affect the nation. For the last ten years, COAST has expended its development initiatives to benefit 100,000 direct beneficiaries of which 90 % are women in 21 upzilas of 6 coastal districts compared to the beginning of COAST.
- 3. The review team visited two major working areas of COAST namely, Bhola and cox's Bazar, In Bhola the team visited Charfasion, Char Motahar and in Cox's Bazar the team visited Moheskhali, Kutubdia and Cox's Bazar Sadar to meet different primary and secondary stakeholders. The team had intensive meetings/ interview / FGDs with field level staff, savings groups, Union Parisad, People's Organisation, UNO, civil society group and other stakeholders where possible in order to have an insight of the major activities undertaken by COAST. COAST activities have been dived into two major areas/ sector what they call is 1) Economic Justice programme and 2) Social justice Programme. Most projects and programmes are put into the said two boxes.
- 4. The review conducted most activities through discussion, interview, FGDs, review documents dialogue ,field visits. The major finding are given below under major findings and recommendations.

A. Major Findings and Recommendations

5. In Economic justice programme a key role played by micro finance programme which has inherited from Action Aid and after that the COAST management has been able to attract PKSF and Stormme Foundation to contribute in microfinance programme. Despite some initial hick ups in programme due to the ignorance of the field staff programme is running very well and very significant achievements have been made by the microfinance team. The achievement reflected in repayment rate of 98% which is remarkable for a NGO working in the disaster prone costal areas along with heavy competition with so many microfinance NGOs including bigger NGOs. Having said that there are always room for improvement because no NGO can claim just perfect. The management of COAST needs to look at the following recommendations for making this programme more effective and efficient, This may help COAST financially sustainable NGO.

i) It is suggested that an in-depth external evaluation is required for giving a clear picture of loss and profit or cost analysis for setting future course of action. It is also important for COAST to have a sustainability plan. The present practice of using profit money in different organisational need should be done in planned way

COAST should think of providing training on IGA selection, feasibility and business plan For the borrowers for undertaking more viable and profitable project. The other staff involved in directly or indirectly with microfinance including paravet need more training to gain knowledge, Skills and confidence

- 6. The support loans during and after disaster have been a great support for poor coastal poor inhabitants. The effort has been appreciated by all concerned.
- a) It is suggested by the stakeholders that COAST can create a risk fund by convincing the donor so that the pressure to spend microfinance money can be stopped.
- b) COAST should think of developing a mechanism so that on group members can withdraw her savings within a short time. Currently it takes long time which does not seem to be a good practice.
- c) COAST have weak linkages / networking with other NGOs in the same area, it is suggested that establishing stronger linkages and networking will help to bring solidarity, and to supplement and complement services of each other to meet up the huge needs of the poorest people living in coastal areas.

The sharing session with local administration and other NGOs may yield good result but the sharing should be done in more diplomatic way to avoid any ambiguity from the side of the government.

6. Peoples organisation under social justice programme and MJF funded project seem to be an innovative approach but the POs have yet to taking off the ground for various reasons mentioned in the analysis part

POs having big portfolios do not have adequate idea about their roles and responsibilities. They even don't know what are the services provided by a UP and how many line departments are there? This implies with most COAST staff working at local level.

COAST should give a serious attention on the issues immediately. TOR and Manual should be updated and developed for the POs. Adequate arrangement should be made by COAST to inform POs and LEBs about all activities of COAST.

7. Model UP / Strengthening Local Government funded by MJF The review team visited only one "Model "UP at Char fassion. The project has achieved some outputs and targets but there are too many things to do which require painstaking efforts from project staff.

i)The review team suggest that the staff working in this project must gain knowledge and experience about "Model UP". The UP visited by the team does not seem to up to the level of becoming a model UP. The staff should have a clear understanding and provide necessary inputs/ services to the UP to make it a" model". The assigned staff should really internalise the activities written in the project documents prior to deliver the services.

It was learnt that meetings of different committees held but neither the UP nor COAST staff have given emphasis to keep resolution of all meetings and follow up of those meetings .It is important to keep resolution of all meeting in proper way and a follow up of those meetings should also be done in planned way. If required COAST may organise couple of hours training on how to keep records and write resolution of meetings. This suggestion is applicable for both COAST staff and UP secretaries.

- 8. SANGLAP is doing well and found very successful. Some Adolescents were found very vocal and expressive which is remarkable. They were found very vocal despite living in a conservative area which really appreciable and credit should go to COAST for such great achievement.
- i) There is a set curriculum being developed by the partner and COAST follows that. It may be a good idea to share with the partner to review the curriculum after certain period so that more need based topics/contents may be incorporated as the needs are changing with the passage of time. The adolescents involved in IGA needs training on IGA activities. They know about bad effect of early marriage, dowry etc, but don't know about the existing laws and punishment for violating the law. The facilitator must inform them about the law related to violence against women and also the services available which COAST does not provide. Linkages, with legal aid organisation would be a good idea though COAST has relationship but the adolescents are not fully aware about those organisation.
- 9. With regard to review of few organisational issues, it appeared to the team that the management needs to review the existing policies and procedures of COAST in making these more easy to understand for all level of staff.
- a) The review team suggests that COAST should have a strategic plan for clear future direction.
- b) Most policies needs to be updated. Gender policy must be separated from HR. Most importantly, every staff needs proper job description immediately. Further to avoid staff dissatisfaction staff skill audit may help the organisation to put right people in right place.

B. Conclusion

On the whole, COAST has been successful in their endeavour; particularly microfinance has gained a momentum which needs to be supported like nurturing a plant but not shouting or misbehaving with the hard working field staff.

The management (BOT) should have yearly retreat to share with all level staff.

The M&E unit needs to developed and well equipped to monitor the activities and provide feedback to the management which is absent currently.

It is felt that the Executive Director should give more time to a particular area for couple of days and try to understand the ground reality. It seems he is becoming detached from the mainstream of COAST because of his involvement in Macro level advocacy, networking which are equally important for the organisation. But the ED should mange time to visit the field level activities.

As mentioned earlier despite some limitations, COAST has created an enabling environment for developing women, adolescents and children and other stakeholders who will act as pioneer in establishing women's social and economic rights in the society. The effort will be more effective if the process and activities are streamlined or consolidated prior further planning.

Review Report of COAST

Chapter-I

1. Background

An international organisation initiated an integrated development programme the costal area of Bhola district in 1984 following the Grameen Bank approach. The programme had several components to serve the poorest people of char areas. The components include adult literacy, collective home tutoring programme for the children, assisted government Expanded programme for Immunisation (EPI), micro credit etc. Since beginning of the Bhola intervention the international organisation had a strategic thinking of phasing out from Bhola by developing an alternate institutional arrangement who can carry forward the programme initiated by them. After series of strategic meetings with staff and mid term review of Bhola operation, it was decided that the operation could be handed over to a Organisation. The staff working under Bhola took the challenge and with the support from different stakeholders, some staff established Coastal Association for Social Transformation. COAST took over Bhola operation in January 1998 from the international organisation since then COAST has been implementing its activities independently without any further support from the said international organisation. Over the period . COAST has expended its development initiatives to benefit 100,000 beneficiaries directly of which 90 % are women in 23 upzilas of 6 coastal Districts compared to the beginning of COAST. The following table shows the locations and the trend of progress of COAST till June 2009.

Indicators	Dec-1998	June-2009
Coverage - District	1	6
Coverage - Upazila	5	23
Coverage - Beneficiary	13,406	1,03,137
Family		
Revolving Credit Fund	49.53 million BDT	324.94 million BDT
Reserve Fund	0.00 million BDT	20.48 million BDT
Emergency Fund	0.05 million BDT	4.64 million BDT
Total Fixed Assets	4.71 million BDT	23.40 million BDT
Capital Fund	40.64 million BDT	34.08million BDT
Savings Fund	21.72 million BDT	101.92 million BDT
Staff - Male	136	638
Staff - Female	40	257

The expansion take place due to the demand been created with the services of COAST along with the visionary leadership and proactive support from BOT and staff.. COAST conducted an internal evaluation in 2009 but the management felt that an external review of the COAST will validate the internal evaluation. In view of that, COAST Board of Trustee employed a team to review COAST management and programme .The activities. Achievements, problems and areas of improvement which were found by the consultants are highlighted in this report.

2. Institutional issues

2.1. Mission statement

COAST organizes strategically important activities related to development, which in turn, will facilitate the sustainable and equitable improvement of life, especially of women, children and disadvantaged population of the coastal areas in Bangladesh through their increased participation in the socio –economic, cultural and civic life of the country.

2.1. Core Values

In 1999, after series of discussion, the COAST staff members developed some values for the organisation. The core values are being practised by most staff. It is suggested that during next strategic plan exercise core values may be revisited to finalise the core values of COAST in accordance with the changed development scenario. The current values as stated in the document are:

- Work approach
- Learning organisation
- Human potentialities
- Economy
- Honour
- Gender
- Right to participation and decision making
- Culture
- Communication
- Accountability
- People's Organisation
- Governance
- Environment and diversity

3. Major Programmes/ Projects of COAST

COAST has two major sector programmes under which, relevant projects and activities were shown. The major sectors are; 1) Economic Justice and 2) Social Justice which cover the following areas;

Bhola, Cox's Bazar, Noakhali, Feni, Laxmipur & Pathuakhali. 50 nos (At Bhola District: Bhola Sador, Velomiar Hat, Daulathkhan, Borhunuddin Sador, Borhungonj, Chandpur, Khaserhat, Charbhuta, Lalmohan, Badorpur, Charumed, Raychand, Janatabazar, Jinnagor, Dularhat, Hajarigonj, Kalmi, Manika, Char Zahiruddin, Monpura, Sakucia, Dalchar, Char Kukrimukri, Char Motahar. At Pathuakhali: Dasmina sador & Char Kajal. At Laxmipur District: Laxmipur sador, Ramgoti & Chandra Gonj. Noakhali District: Noakhali Sador, Begumgonj & Sonapur At Fani District: Fani Sador & Dagobhuya. Cox's Bazar District: Cox's Bazar Sador, Eidgaon, Dhurung, Kutubdia, Pekua Pekua. Teknaf, Ukhia, Ramu, Hnila, Chokoria, Khutha Khali, Bador Khali, Kalarmarchara, Hoanok, Moheshkhali & Cox'bazar sador -2

Besides, COAST has undertaken some important activities which are also stated below;

3.1. Types of beneficiaries, Needs and services provided by COAST

Types of Stakeholders ¹	Characteristics	Actual Needs	Service provided by COAST	Demand /Needs from stakeholder s	Future Strategy to fulfil the needs of stakeholders
Hard core Poor	Monthly income below 2000 taka and land owned less than 5 decimal Divorcee (women) Widow Abandoned (husband left leaving behind wife & children) Women headed	- Credit - Savings deposit - Awareness - Pr. Health care - Income generating activity	- Credit & Savings mobilization - Group Mgt. and Dev. Ed Pr. Health - Technical assistance in IGA - Training - Peoples organisation, demand mediation and access to local government	- Big (comparativ e) loan. - Insurance	- Package review. - Policy Change of donors
Poor Women and Man	Monthly income below 3000 taka Less than 50 decimals of land Divorcee Widow Abandoned (husband left leaving behind wife & children) Women headed	- Credit & Savings deposit - Awareness - Pr. Health care - Income generating activity	- Credit & Savings mobilization - Group Mgt. - Dev. Education - Pr. Health - Technical assistance. - Training	- Need base product - Insurance	-Package review. - Policy change of donor
Small Entrepreneur	 Members of 2 years old savings groups Monthly income below Tk. 7000. less than 200 decimal of land Production oriented Opportunity to create employment 	- Credit - Savings deposit - Training	- Credit & Savings mobilization - Group Mgt. - Dev. Ed. - Technical assistance. - Training	- IGA Training - Insurance	- Package review.
Children and Adolescents boys and girls	Children below 5 years of age and never enrolled in school Age between 14-18 years Drop out or non school going children	- Education - Financial support	- Primary education - Life skill training and IGA and Financial support	- Insufficient	

The above matrix is the reflection of the types of beneficiaries COAST support through its different programme and the unmet needs as well as proposed strategy to address the unmet needs in the future as derived from exercise during the study.

¹ Source: Head, Operation, COAST.

3.2. Economic Justice Programme

3.2.1 Micro finance Technical Support Project (MFTSP)

COAST inherited guite a substantial amount 68.21 million BDT as asset according to the audit report, 1998) of micro credit from successors and gradually it has expanded to other areas to support poor beneficiaries of Bhola and Cox's Bazar coastal areas. The major micro finance support receives from PKSF and Stromme Foundation. The micro finance programme covers Bhola, Cox's Bazar, Noakhali, Feni, Laxmipur & Pathuakhali. Following are the brief information of Micro finance activities as on 31 December 2009.

Total Groups : 3124

Total Members : 80985 persons (Male-2634, Female-78351)

Borrowers /Loanee : 56010 (Female-53999, Male-2011)

Loan Dispurse...

Loan Recovery

Loan outstanding

Loan Recovery rate

Saving deposited

Tk. 3456415...

98%

Tk. 105279789/- (Balance)

Tk. 8927533/
Tk. 28299043/-Tk. 3,693,416,000/-Loan Disbursement

Total Overdue : Tk. 37226575/-

Table-3.2.2. Fund Received and Refunded from PKSF & Stromme Foundation up to 31 December, 2009

Source of fund	Amount Received (Tk)	Amount Refunded (Tk)	Amount to be Refunded (Tk)
PKSF	468051275	261184607	197116668
Stromme Foundation	218055000	155055000	63000000

3.2.3 IGA activities

Under Economic justice programme, there are lots of IGA activities undertaken by micro credit borrowers, Adolescents, and other beneficiaries which helped them to bring positive changes in their livelihood. Major IGA activities are:

- 1. Cow Rearing
- 2. **Goat Rearing**
- 3. Poultry Rearing
- 4. Beef fattening
- 5. Rice husk poultry hatchery
- 6. Al (Artificial Insemination) Centre for Cow and Goat
- 7. Vaccination Program (poultry and dairy)
- 8. **Buck station**
- 9. Dairy farm

- Vegetable growing
- 11. Dry fish processing
- 12. Beatle leaf cultivation
- 13. Salt cultivation
- 14. Irrigation pump
- 15. Fishing boat / Net

3.2.4 Micro Finance Technical Support Project (MFTSP)

Micro Finance Technical Support Project (MFTSP) is funded by Palli Karma Shahayak Foundation (PKSF) for ensuring the technical support (training, logistic and inputs) to the beneficiaries along with micro finance.

During our interview the review team learnt and observed that, through program the income level of beneficiaries have been increased and their technical knowledge have also been improved as stated by the beneficiaries. For example., they have accumulated some assets, children are going to school, have given emphasis on sanitation and could articulate about their rights in front of the review team. This prevails that there have been a significant changes in the live of most borrowers. Following activities have been accomplished till 2009 i) total no. of buck station is 36 (each station contains 2-3 bucks), ii) total no. of broiler rearing centre is 38 (each centre contains 300-500 birds in each batch), iii) total no. of model breeder is 30 (each breeder rears 200-250 laying birds), iv) total no. of poultry keeper is 2489 (each keeper rears 15-50 poultry birds), v) total no. of goat keeper is 1532 (each keeper rears 2-5 goats), vi) Total no. of cow rarer is 2650 (each rear has 1-2 cows), vii) total no. of feed seller is 8, viii) total no. of rice husk hatchery is 13 (each hatchery hatches 200-250 eggs per month), ix) total no. of poultry vaccinator is 30 (each vaccinator vaccinates 400-500 birds and per month income is taka 600-1500) and ix) total no. of homestead gardening is 496 (each gardener cultivates at least six varieties of vegetables throughout the year). From the learning of Bhola, the MFTS program has been expanded to Cox's Bazar region under six branches those are implementing through MFTS with the support form micro finance surplus. For maintaining model chain COAST established two rearing centres in Burhanuddin and Kutubdia. In these centres the chick and ducklings are reared for brooding period (8 weeks of age). Then those chicks and ducklings are supplied to beneficiaries for further rearing for getting production. These centres are running with no loss no profit basis. According to the financial analysis the performance of these centres are satisfactory.

3.2.5 Support loans

After two devastating cyclones named "SIDR" and "AILA" the support loan has been distributed to the affected poor people as SAHOS (Special assistance for Housing of SIDR) and RESCUE (rehabilitation of SIDR affected coastal fishery, small business and livestock enterprise). The service charge of the above support loan is respectively 0% and 4% SAHOS and RESCUE had been disbursed for the affected but poor people who lost their houses and income generation projects. COAST received taka 4 million for SAHOS and taka 36 million for RESCUE from PKSF. The programme covered 637 borrowers through SAHOS and 3245 borrowers through RESCUE. COAST have also other types of support loans like emergency flood restoration and rehabilitation assistance program (EFRRAP) and ultra poor support loan with 2.5 million for EFRRAP and taka 30 million for ultra poor from PKSF. A total of f 573 and 2363 borrowers received loans from EFRRAP and ultra poor.

3.2.6 Support Income Generating Activities as SIDR rehabilitation part

After sidr, COAST responded immediately to support their beneficiaries with the relief and rehabilitation programme for worst affected areas mostly char areas. About 7000 poor people were affected in Bhola char areas. The aim of the programme was restoration of livelihood through cash for work, IGA input supply and ensuring water and sanitation services to the affected people. COAST relief team distributed 600 packet of dry food in different cyclone affected areas located in very remote and islands and in each pack there are rice, oil, pulse, potato, flatten rice, molasses, salt, candle light, etc, so that a family can at least continue having food for four days. COAST relief team started cash for work in the island to drain out the saline water from land and ponds, repair roads and also provided pumping of saline water from the common using ponds. All these have done from COAST own fund, spending around taka 600,000 (in US \$ 10,000) in coordination with local government administration.

Apart from this COAST has implemented a rehabilitation program with the financial support from Stromme Foundation amounting 3.7 million BDT. This amount has spend for safe drinking water supply, health service improvement especially paramedics development, aforestation and creating Income generating Activities (IGA) for affected people.

4. Social Justice Programme

Social justice sector of COAST Trust has been aiming to build alternative power structure/ a pressure group / of the poor at local level for undertaking social issues that affect the community especially the poor people like, demand mediation, organised campaign against unjust, campaign for persuasion of local issues benefit the community at large. This also help capacity building of the groups who in terns will have access to public services through establishing their rights. COAST has undertaken different activities which are being operated at staff level and group level. The activities are; strengthening local government institutions, human rights, capacity building of LEBs, support to protect violence against women, minority eviction, acid throwing, political reform and enhance capacity of democratic institution. Not all of these are being conducted as individual project, some of these are undertaken as cross cutting issues of different projects.

4.1. Facilitate free & fair election and contributing in preparing national ID card & good governance

During last municipal and national election, COAST has been contributed actively for fair election and greater contribution made in national ID card project being a member of Election Working Group(EWG) with technical and financial support of the Asia foundation. The project was financed by a donor consortium to The Asia Foundation who in turn put money to EWG and 32 network organisation including COAST.

Under this project, COAST along with other EWG member have formed Citizen Alliance for Promoting Transparency and Accountability (CAPTA) in upazila level to work as "watch dog" for the candidates and to make elected representatives accountable to its constituents. The Current EWG work has been only concentrated on CAPTA as there is no election now.

5. Building Capacities for Human Rights Activism: Integration of Sustainable Local Governance Compact

This project is funded by Manusher Jonnon Foundation (MJF). In the operational plan there are some inconsistencies with the activities mentioned in the proposal, it may so happen due to the several revision of the project documents . The operational plan needs to be developed reviewing the logical frame work in the project proposal .. The proposal is for the period from May 2007-April 2010 (docs. Provided by COAST) where as, the operational plan is made from 2007-2008 , no plan for 2009-2010 was made available at implementation level. It was not possible for the team to review the wide range of activities because of non availability of project document at the field level. When asked, a two page hand written activities handed over to the team at the last minutes of the visit. However, the activities do not fully match with the activities mentioned in the LFA due to frequent changes of the project document in consultation with the donor.

The activities and progress at a glance of the project:

Activities and inputs	OVI	Comments/ Recommendation
1.Human rights monitoring and	1.1 .15 Local organization/	1.1 In the first year 15 organisations were
mobilization at districts level.	progressive individual were	selected – only one NGO leader was
1.1.Upazila level organization appointed	appointed by 1st year	present in civil society meeting at cox's Bazar. The team could not visit any NGO
for HR monitoring and Mobilization at 15	1.2 Monthly basis monitoring of	because of time constraints
UPz	HR violence at 15 Upazila in 2 districts	1.2 COAST should think of developing appropriate monitoring tools and monitoring
1.2 HR Monitoring & Mobilization	1.3 2 seminar in Bhola and 2 seminar in Cox'sbazar held in 2 years	reports to be disseminated . Further training is required for the field staff on the techniques of participatory monitoring .
1.3 Yearly Seminar on HR situation at 2 district	1.4 15 orientation workshop in 15 Upazila 1st year	1.3. Seminar held in 1st year but the staff could not articulate the outcome of the
1.4 Upazila level sensitization on	45.01	seminar. Particularly the HR situation . 1.4. About orientation workshop, the team
Constitutional Rights and Universal HR charter	1.5 2 booklets published in 1st year	feels that a review should have been done on the effectiveness of workshops and how they are supporting HR issues.
Booklet publication Constitutional Rights and Universal HR charter		they are supporting in closures.

- 2. Preparing Union Parished as Preparing Union Parished as participatory institutions
- 2.1 20 Secretary & 3 accounts staffs will be provided UP office mgt & accounts training
- 2.2 Development Planning meeting for UP yearly and long term 5 years
- 2.3 Annual Planning and budget publication printing
- 2.4 One day orientation and monthly standing committee meeting (4 committee meeting per month; health, education, Agriculture & livestock
- 2.5 Open Budget Meeting at Union level
- 2.6 5 year planning meeting and book printing
- 2.7 Program Brief and MoU signed meeting with union
- 2.8 Monthly Union coordination meeting
- 2.9 Logistic support to Union Parishad
- 2.10 standing committee mobilization
- 2.11 Review meeting at Dhaka with UP chairman.

- 2.1 20 Secretary & 3 accounts staffs will be provided UP office mgt & accounts training by 2nd year
- 2.2 Ward level consultation meeting and UP level priority setting meeting for 20 model IIP
- 2.3 300 copies of planning and budget books for each union.
- 2.4 Each UP have future plan for
- 4 standing committee and having monthly meeting 2.5 Yearly program review meeting at Dhaka/Bhola / Cxb with 20 chairmen
- 2.6 Five year plan for each of 20 Unions
- 2.7 Agreement with 20 UP with half day workshop
- 2.8 Each of the 20 Unions meet regular monthly coordination meeting.
- 2.9 Display board, 1 Bill Board,Logistic support to each of 20UP office2.10 Standing committee will
- 2.10 Standing committee will demonstrate at least 4 mobilizations at 20 Ups one time for one year.
- 2.11 20 UP chairman CAOST personnel and MJF concern person reviewed the program

- 2.1. The training has been conducted and observing one UP the secretary could show us the hand outs but could not articulate the learning. As he is new in this UP, he need more input from project staff. Moreover, the UP members, staff should have proper orientation about the objective & activities of the project.
- 22. It is learnt that consultation meetings held but no evidence of how many and what priorities have been set could not be validated due to lack of evidence.

 2.3 The UP visited by the team has not
- seen any budget books 2.4. No such plan was observed in written form. The plan should be put UP so that all citizen can see and know the plan. This
- 2.5 No information and plan could be obtained by the review team

is absent in the UP the team visited

- 2.6 No idea about the 5 year UP plan . No hint was given either by project staff or by the UP chairman and members during our meeting . The status is not clearly known
- 2.7 Done as stated by project staff but not found any evidential proof. .
- 2.8 Monthly meeting held but no resolution, agenda and decisions are written properly. It is suggested that COAST staff and UP secretary needs training on how to record resolution and follow up those in the next meeting. It was observed that both UP and COAST field office are weak in documentation. If this is not properly kept all hard work will go in vein.
- 2.9 No display boards , poster, budget sheets were found in the UP (mentioned details in earlier r)

- 3. Policy research and advocacy on coastal issues (COAST):
- 3.1 Documentary on HR of fisherman community and advocacy for decentralization of boat registration
- 3.2 Policy advocacy events on four issues i.e., climate change, Local Government, Coastal livelihood, HR and Microfinance.
- 3.1 One Documentary film was developed by 2nd year .
- 3.2 Total 3 events on policy advocacy (6 brief papers on climate change, Fisherman livelihood, Integration of Microfinance and Human Rights, Impact of modle Union) conducted in during the project period.
 3.3 20 chairman, 40 PO

leaders, 15 upazila HR

- 3.1 The team could not obtain any information.
- (COAST can Put their comments and achievement)

- 3.3 Sharing meeting with elected Upazila Chairman and Vice-Chairman at district level
- defenders and district level participants and national chief guest) total 70
- 3.4 One Documentary film was developed by 2nd year .
- 3.5 Total 3 events on policy advocacy (6 brief papers on climate change, Fisherman livelihood, Integration of Microfinance and Human Rights, Impact of modle Union) conducted in during the project period.
- 3.6 20 chairman, 40 PO leaders.
- 15 upazila HR dfefenders and district level participants and national chief guest) total 70 participants in each of the District
- 4.1 20 to 25 mix group form with 70:30::female:male at each ward of the 20 unions.
- 4.2 9 members working committee with 5 advisors elected by 5 working committee members of intervention group. They meet bimonthly at union level
- 4.3 15 upazila Jonoshangathan meet quarterly meeting with OC, TNO, and other government officers at Upazila for planning and coordination
- 4.4 President and secretary of each intervention group provided 2 days training on leadership
- 4.5 200 Pisces of Development Edn. Books by 1st year
- 4.6 3000 social action achieved/ conducted during the project period.
- 4.7 20 local volunteers recruited and provided 3 days basic training on group facilitation
- 5.1 18 staffs Provided project briefing on implementation and responsibility.

- 4. Building Peoples Organization as representation of the poor as a rights claiming mechanism
- 4.1. Intervention Group formation and monthly mobilization meeting
- 4.2. Peoples Jonoshangathan formation and regular meeting
- 4.3. Quarterly Upazila Officials and Jonoshangathan face to face meeting
- 4.4. Leadership Development training for Peoples Organization leaders
- 4.5. Develop a manual on development education
- 4.6. Planning for social action and Mobilization
- 4.7. Volunteer appointment and basic training
- 5. Capacity building: generic and especial training course for staff development:
- 5.1 Project implementation plan and brief training to 18 staffs.

5. 1. Jano Sangathan /People's Organisation(PO)

Peoples organisation under MJF funded project is a good idea provided they know their responsibilities and can act on behalf of the poor people of the groups they represent. It appears during our discussion that , most POs are pre- matured. They need more intensive training on the roles and responsibilities and accessing to services.

.The structure of jano sangathan/ People's Organisation (PO) are;

- i) Chair person
- ii) Asst. Chair person
- iii) Secretary
- iv) Secretary financial development
- v) Secretary of cultural
- vi) Secretary of social
- vii) Secretary of political

Meeting:

The monthly meeting of jano sangathan held on 20th in every month as stated by the members present.

Training:

The members of jano sangathan did not receive any training as stated by the members of POs

Impact and comments

The members of PO have taken some initiatives in their personal & community level such as prevention of early marriage, initiatives to reduce dowry and monitoring of education programme run by government . unfortunately no written report was found . A committee was formed from among members of PO, civil society , elected representatives. They informed they have visited couple of schools and report back in monthly meeting. Unfortunately, the review team were not able to see the minutes of the meetings and monitoring reports. Despite some unplanned activities ,they made following suggestions to be implemented in the future.

- i) To change the traditional attitude and knowledge of the community people in a para meeting or in an informal set up when villagers meet almost daily. The objective will also include ensuring allowing women to go out and participate different meetings held at UPs and different forums.
- ii) They may orient the mothers and aware them about the bad effect of 'early marriage', Anti natal and post-natal care, breast feeding, immunization and education of their children.
- iii) They can help UP female members to distribute the VGD card properly.
- iv) They can oversee and monitor that students allowance for primary level are given properly.
- v) They can handle the women violence related issue through mediation with the support from concerned UP members if needed they may seek support from UP chairperson.

6. Education Programme

COAST initiated the education programme in 2003 with the support from SF. This programme started with the following seven components;

- 6.1 Pre- primary children education
- 6.2 Reflect/ adolescent Shonglap
- 6.3 Quality education in primary school
- 6.4 Support to non-registered & junior school established by local people
- 6.5 Literacy for working children and continuing education
- 6.6 Learn mother language for *Rhakhain* (Tribal people) children
- 6.7 Advocacy work to reduce unsuccessful rate in SSC examination and create accountability of schools

An external review was conducted in 2005. Based on the recommendations COAST redesigned the programme and scale down the following four components in lieu of seven, eg, SANGLAP, ECDC, mainstream education in Maktab and Back to high school of drop out girls. The whole package was dedicated for the children of the poor families in coastal areas.

Education program is a newly designed one where four components have been approved or selected components

At the end of 2009, COAST established a total of 70 SANGLAP centers for 1750 adolescent girls. They have completed one year course and most adolescents have been engaged in income generating activities after IGA training as stated by COAST staff. The team observed that the adolescents learnt about the importance of cleanliness, sanitation, reproductive health, bad effect of early marriage, dowry,

Until 2009 there were 70 nos of SANGLAP centres established with at least 1750 no. of adolescents

About the Early Childhood Development Centre (ECDC), the team learnt that about 3589 children have completed one year course through 88 Maktab and 66 non-Maktab centered ECDC. Most children from this program have been enrolled in the primary schools.

COAST has been implementing "Ananda" "আৰুদ বিদ্যালয় " under Reaching Out of school Children (ROSC) in Bhola and Noakhali district. This programme aims to provide primary education to the children who some how could not admitted in primary school as well as drop out children of the poor families. All "Ananda" School follows government curriculum and the teachers claimed to be trained by COAST. It is important to note that place for holding classes are provided by the community but the teachers are well paid for conducting two hours class in week days. COAST as a resource organisation has been providing skill development training of the teachers. The skill development training needs to have more refreshers courses for the teachers ...

The project locations are situated in Bhola and Noakhali district and COAST is basically responsible for providing training those are selected by the government. There are total 930 school have covered at least 32550 students where 35 student enrolled per school. COAST providing necessary monitoring activities along with training for the teachers also.

7. The Vulnerable Group Development (VGD) Programme

The VGD program have been undertaken in April 2009 with the support from WFP. This intervention is aims to reach exclusively to ultra poor house holds. The VGD program covers all Upazila of Bhola district for 19553 ultra poor households. The project is expected to end in December 2010. The objective of the intervention is to provide opportunities to women for improving their livelihoods. COAST has a plan to mainstream these women at the end of the project period.

8. Integration of Sustainable Health (Preventive health care for the remote areas)

In 1998, COAST initiated this programme through 6 branches in outreach islands. With the positive response and observing the health hazards, COAST expanded similar activities in 10 branches in Cox's Bazar district. The "Paramedics" were selected from locally and trained for 6.5 months from Gana Shasthya Kendra (GK). Paramedics are providing the following services, health awareness building among lactating and pregnant mothers and under five children through household visits and counseling, treatment of diarrhea, dysentery, different skin diseases, fever, pregnancy test and diabetic test. They also provide some medicine with minimum profit (some says no profit). If they see any complication of any patients they refer to upazila and district health complex. They also supply contraceptives to the women as depot holders. It is learnt that this programme is running with the service charge earned from micro finance and it recovers only 40 % of the total cost incurred.

9. Reorganization: consolidation of working area, intervention group formation, demand and supply side relationship

In 2009, COAST recruited 20 volunteers to work closely with 20 "model" Union Parisads (UPs). In each word of these UPs a total of 180 intervention groups have been formed. The group members are drawn from civil societies. These intervention groups are called People's organization. These groups (Pos) are responsible to demand the rights of the people from the government, LEBs and private agencies. The achievements of these interventions are signing memorandum of understanding (MOU) between intervention groups and model UPs. The interventions groups conducted 180 meetings for proper tax collection, open budget preparation, UP annual reports, observation of world human rights day in city areas, etc.

10. SHOUHARDO (Strengthening Household Ability to Respond Development Opportunity)

COAST Trust has been implementing the SHOUHARDO program in Pekua and Kutubdia upazila under Cox's Bazar district since 2006 with the technical support and partnership of CARE. This programme has ended in February 2010. A total of 7876 beneficiaries are involved in this programme. As CARE is phasing out , COAST has prepared a long term plan to bring this beneficiaries under micro finance programme. It is learnt that already 40% members already brought under MF in December 2009 and the gradually the rest will be brought by March 2010.

11. Promoting Sustainable Coastal Aquaculture in Bangladesh (ProSCAB) Project

COAST has been implementing this project since July 2008 in partnership with of Bangladesh Fisheries Research Forum (BFRF) and DFID. The project will continue till June 2011. The project is covering 20 fishing community of 11 unions of 8 upazilas in two coastal districts e, g, Cox's Bazar and Chittagong. The objectives of the project are i) group formation, mobilization and awareness creation, group meeting, providing group members training on technology, ii) ensuring stakeholders' involvement for adding value chain of the products, iii) assisting enterprise development and marketing of products,

12 CREP (COAST Renewable Energy Project)

COAST has introduced a new project title Coastal Renewable Energy Project (CREP) since 2002. This project is supported by Infrastructure Development Company Limited (IDCOL) and distributed 50 numbers of Solar Home System (SHS) full grant basis to promote the SHS use among the poor at first phase. The second phase is started through a refinancing model where IDCOL has been refinancing a percentage of grant alongside 80% of loan support.

COAST expand this program at least 24 upazila under Noakhali, Laxmipur, Feni, Cox's Bazar and Patuakhali district. Now this program is successfully installed total 3301 SHS and its becoming a popular program among the poor families considering the low cost and climate friendly management in remote chars and islands.

This is quite difficult to assess the impact of SHS as quantitative measure, as the SHS is being installed to support in view of daily household perspectives nevertheless the review has identified the following impact.

Maximum clients have said that they are very much satisfied to see the performance of SHS, because they are getting the light during night which was un-imaging in previous. They are also feel free in mentally due to movement with comfort and less in-house environmental haziness.

A significant impact is observed in changing the study habit and timing period of students. 100% clients said that their children continue their study during night due to SHS light which would be helpful doing good result in future. Installing SHS has also reduced the cost of fuel. Beneficiaries have told that they have able to reduce and save their fuel cost at least 277 per month which is treated as an earnings in real sense.

13. Partnership with ASF (Acid Survivors Foundation)

A Three years Memorandum of Understanding (MoU) has been signed between COAST and Acid Survivors Foundation (ASF)in February 2009. The ambitious objectives of the agreement are; i) rehabilitation of acid survivors and to reduce acid violence almost in zero level by 2015. This effort will certainly help COAST and ASF in reducing acid violence in the area as both organizations are working in the same area.

14. EquityBD

Equity and Justice Working Group, Bangladesh (EquityBD) is a right-based 19 NGOs alliance that envisions a society with equity and justice based on human rights and democratic values. Its mission is to promote research, debate and campaign for policy and practice changes. The Alliance was established in 2007. Since its inception EquityBD has been working for a credible civil/people society movement in local and national level. The major strategies of EquityBD's are: a) positive engagement with national government and global institutions, b) study on policy issues and dissemination to sensitize relevant stakeholders, c) sensitizing youths on the values of equity, justice, democracy and human rights, d) promoting local level activism and volunteerism. Till date EquityBD organized campaigns like; (i) opposing policy support instrument of IMF, (ii) critical review of PRSP and plea for a sovereign and long-term development planning for the country, (iii) debt cancellation, (iv) awareness raising on the impacts of climate change and claiming compensation and reparation in line with the climate justice, especially during the Bali climate conference, G8 summit in Japan, (v) series of media discourse on food sovereignty and climate justice during pre and post budget period, (vi) aid accountability and (v) protesting involvement of the World Bank in the management of Multi Donor Trust Fund (MDTF) for Bangladesh on the eve of UK Bangladesh climate conference, (iv) campaign for the rights of the climate

It has also been raising voice against local environmental hazards particularly in the alliance members working area.

15. Objective of the Review

The prime objective of this review is to assess the impact of different development² program along with future challenge and opportunities for the organization that will create a pave of uniqueness in development field. To achieve the objective the review will also try to interact with the following areas.

- a. Assess the changes of livelihood options of members' beneficiaries during the period.
- b. Identify and assess the development trend on asset creation and income opportunities of poor beneficiaries.
- How poor people especially women are becoming empowered through the core program (especially Micro Finance, Development Education and Peoples Organization activities).
- d. Assess the integration of rights base approach and their implementation status in different development program especially micro finance, disaster management those will give the human face.
- e. Analysis the time line of different program those have made the changes and their impacts
- f. Assess the effectiveness of different development program and identify the challenges of continuation of these program targeting future perspective and needs.
- g. Formulate the future recommendation in policy and practice level.

21

² As stated in the TOR provided by COAST

Keeping the above objectives in mind the consultant team have reviewed the programme, achievement, challenges which are illustrated in this report.

16. Methodology of review

The review has been mainly qualitative and participative in nature, focusing primarily on perception analysis of the project stakeholders as a means of validation of the documented progress of activities. While views and opinions of the different stakeholders of the organisation as well as projects at all level were elicited, resort to secondary data sources was made by the consultants in the first place to acquaint themselves with the organisation mission and objectives, internal review as well as the progress to date as documented by COAST.

Both Focus Group Discussions (FGD) and Key Informants Interviews (KII) were held with the senior management, beneficiaries, regional and filed staff to ascertain their views mainly on the implementation procedures and the efficiency and constraints faced during implementation.

FGD sessions were also conducted with the local elected bodies, civil society, beneficiaries. Informal discussions and key informants interviews were held with the community people, UNO and a few neighbouring NGOs.

Relevant documents like; policies, manuals, movement resisters, action plan, Annual report, Internal evaluation report and other materials were reviewed by the consultants

17. Rationale of using different methodologies

The Review study has been essentially a participatory study focusing on the perception analysis of the stakeholders. A total of six methods with tools were used w in eliciting the views and opinions of the stakeholders from different level.

Documents Review

The consultant reviewed quite large number of materials related to the objective of the study, concept ,implementation strategies , reports, annual reports, MOU,s manuals, ToRs, and available policy guidelines including gender policy to have an overall idea of the organisational strengths, weakness and management capacity.

Focus Group Discussion (FGD)

FGD was one such methodology that used at all levels extensively. The rationale behind using such a method was that the FGD sessions enable the participants to extensively discuss the pros and cons of an issue among themselves before arriving at a particular consensus, and in such an event, the opinion of all the participants is reflected. FGD has been a very effective participatory method, particularly when dealing with the staff and beneficiaries, whose individual ideas may not be so articulated owing to their education and socio-economic background.

Key Informants Interview (KII)

KIIs are usually held with such persons, usually project in charge and staff, who have specific technical and programmatic knowledge about various aspects of the projects and are expected to provide the consultants with scientific answers and explanations. While conducting KII, a discussion guideline is normally used.

Informal Interviews

Informal Interviews are held with such important persons who are at the periphery of the project and are not participants in the project implementation *par se*. But at the same time, they do have knowledge about the activities being implemented in and around them as well as about the achievements and related impacts on the community.

Group discussion

Group discussion with microfinance / savings group generally gives an insight of about changes of their livelihood due to the interventions. Issues have been discussing about their rights, access to services n problems needs, etc.

Case Study

Case study generally more in depth review of the persons activities and changes have taken place to his/ her family and it also help gain knowledge how the persons invention or what are his / her activities that make her/ him different from others.

18. Study areas

The team visited Charfasion, Char Motahar of Bhola District and Kutubdia, Moheskhali and Cox's Bazar sadar of Cox's Bazar Upazila as requested by the COAST management as well as due to the time constraints.

Chapter-II

Analysis of the Findings and Recommendations

1 Introductory note

It was evident that given the challenges of implementing diversified programmes and projects in remotest coastal areas, an innovative type of project in a social setting beset with poverty, illiteracy and religious superstition as well as geographical diversity the effort invested by COAST with the support from different donors, has proved to be quite rewarding despite disaster, river erosion and flood., cyclone, tidal wave.

With a view to eliciting opinion and perceptions of the different categories of the stakeholders both at the central, regional and field level on the to-date implementation status of the Projects/ programmes a participatory approach was adopted. At the very outset, discussion was carried out by the consultants with COAST senior management and Dhaka based staff members to acquaint with the expectation of COAST from the review. This was followed by FGDs/ discussion with concerned staff associated with the implementation of the project. At the field level, the Team used different methodology with a view to ascertain necessary information for the said study. A work plan was prepared by the review team in consultation with COAST prior to carrying out the field level activities. The team was asked to make a brief sharing session before the Board of Trustees in COAST office. Based on the feed back of sharing session and on the findings from all levels this report is presented.

2 Major findings and recommendations

The elicited opinion and perceptions of participating stakeholders on the crosscutting issues related to various aspects of COAST as stipulated in the TOR are presented in the following sections:

2.1. Institutional issues

COAST is run by a very competent Board of Trustee(BoT) who have full trust and confidence on the Executive Director and core staff. It was observed that COAST has a visionary leader and his vision needs to be shared among all staff. The BoT seems very willing to learn whether COAST is in right track? While going through the documents related to organisational issues, it appeared that COAST have mingled vision and mission together. It is learnt that COAST has been in the process of preparing their strategic plan which will certainly address the visison, mission, goal and strategic direction which will guide them to achieve organisational goal. Further to our review it reveals that most filed level staff have a very few knowledge about vision and mission. The COAST senior staff expressed that they had a strategic plan but somehow, they could not follow or apply the recommendations. Most staff has not even seen that report yet. A vision statement is sometimes called a picture of the organisation in the future but it's so much more than that. The vision statement is the inspiration, the framework for all your strategic planning. A vision statement answers the question, "Where do we want to go?"

The Review team strongly suggests that COAST should think of conducting strategic planning exercises with the participation of all level of staff, BoT and other stakeholders for a strategic direction. The strategic plan acts as a navigation tool; with it COAST will get the clear indication of present situation as well as future destination, and it will also help in designing their road map. It will provide a point of reference, which must be used, assessed and updated as the organisational (internal/external) environment changes. Consequently, the strategic plan is important for COAST to strengthen its capacity for adapting significant environmental changes by;

- 1. Revisiting / formulating COAST, mission, strategies, structures and activities in order to make the best use of opportunities and to overcome the threats that exist in the environment;
- 2. Paying particular attention to interpret and identify the strengths & areas for improvement;
- 3. Analyzing stakeholders requirement;
- 4. Analyzing existing programs to find out future scope of expansion;
- 5. Determining the critical issues that needs to be addressed;
- 6. Deciding strategic directions for strengthening COAST by addressing the critical issues as well as to ensure democratic practice towards good governance and
- 7. Setting Action Plan/ operation plan as a road map for implementing the Strategic Plan.

The benefits of Strategic planning

Strategic planning serves a variety of purposes in organization, including to:

- 1. Clearly define the purpose of the organization and to establish realistic goals and objectives consistent with that mission in a defined time frame within the organization's capacity for implementation.
- 2. Communicate those goals and objectives to the organization's constituents/stakeholders
- 3. Develop a sense of ownership of the plan.
- 4. Ensure the most effective use is made of the organization's resources by focusing the resources on the key priorities.
- 5. Provide a base from which progress can be measured and establish a mechanism for informed change when needed.
- 6. Bring together of everyone's best and most reasoned efforts have important value in building a consensus about where an organization is going.
- 7. Provides clearer focus of organization, producing more efficiency and effectiveness.
- 8. Bridges staff, members, Executive Committee and donor
- 9. Builds strong teams in the board and the staff
- 10. Provides the glue that keeps the board together
- 11. Produces great satisfaction among planners around a common vision
- 12. Increases productivity from increased efficiency and effectiveness
- 13. Solves major problems

2.2 Policies /procedures / systems/ Staff knowledge and capacity

Most policies are available but it revealed from the discussion that most policies are not updated / separated and sometime senior staff takes decision by passing the policies. Moreover, some policies are quite old compared to the present changing socio economic and political trends. The staff capacity building take place but not in a planned and organized manner.

 As stated by the staff, Policies of COAST like, personnel policy, HR Manual, Gender Policy etc. need to be reviewed and updated as the development trend and priorities have been changing rapidly.. Revealed

- 2. Staff recommended to separate personnel policy from HR policy and make available for all staff in order to know rules better
- 3. Staff orientation done but there is a need for planned orientation and training before giving the responsibility, The staff opined that staff should not be given responsibility prior to proper orientation & Training
- 4. The complexity must resolved for the greater interest of the organization
- 5. Some staff are unhappy with the attitude and behavior of the senior staff as well as regional staff. They opined that senior staff are too autocratic and abuse junior staff. The management should try not to make the organization a bureaucratic one and keep eyes open so that human rights are not violated being an advocate of human rights.
- 6. Not all staff are aware of the organisational objectives and core values though these are clearly written in dairy and reports . A mechanism need to develop to make staff understand and actualize all .
- 7. Staff job description must be provided in details and updated.
- 8. Organisational structure needs to review to incorporate some positions which are missing in the existing structure . HR , M&E should be separate and under direct control of ED.
- 9. Staff development policy and plan should be developed including a data base and management should think of how more staff development take place rather than a few staff have been gaining experiences from abroad training
- 10. A mechanism needs to be developed to share the learning of foreign training.

2.3 Monitoring and Evaluation

COAST has a Research unit but the monitoring and evaluation appear to be weak. Not much monitoring using different tools are used to measure the ongoing program and no adequate input provided by the monitoring staff to field staff. There is a lack of planned monitoring system in place. The Dhaka staff visit the project sites or regional offices, sometime this becomes a fear for the low level staff of losing their job because of abuse, shouting, misbehave which hinders the development of staff rather help disowned the programme and organization.

- 1. COAST should have a strong M&E unit to ensure quality outputs.
- 2. More planned monitoring visit from Dhaka level staff required with a feedback report to all concerned and MIS system needs to be developed and strengthened
- 3. More justice should me made with regards to behaving with the junior staff, mutual respect irrespective positions should be ensured by the management
- 4. Satff have been serving for long time should not take advantage of being founding members rather help others to develop a sense of ownership with their behavior, inputs, respect and appreciations.
- All staff should practice core values and should develop themselves as professionals with high degree of commitment

3. Economic Justice Programme

The major focus of economic justice programme is micro finance programme which is supported by PKSF and Stormee Foundation. Despite some reporting problem from the field couple of years ago, the micro finance programme is running well and has created a momentum which may help COAST in self financed in the future. This programme is moving forward and repayment rate is at a satisfactory level (98%), this has been possible due to immediate intervention of the management with appropriate approach which seems very good.

The field level staff seem hard working, committed and successful despite some inadequate skill and knowledge Instead of weak supportive & participatory monitoring, the field staff have been reporting to respective units, regional and

head office for which the field staff deserve appreciation

1. It is recommended that an in depth external evaluation on microfinance may be conducted in order to find out surplus, loss and sustainability plan. Without any sustainability plan the surplus will be spent with out plan and after sometime, it will appear that there is not much surplus. The present practice of using surplus money should be a planned one by a professional / expert.

With regards to the qualitative achievement, it was observed that the microfinance programme has brought very positive changes in the livelihood of the borrowers. Most borrowers confidence level have been raised, they have their own business through IGA which found profitable and sending their children to school. It was learnt they have been more united as a group and conflict among group members are solved through mutual understanding and mediation. They seem heard about the bad effect of dowry, early marriage and violence against women but they could not spelled out in details of any issues they learnt from COAST staff apart from savings and credit.

The credit group members (women) are being organized and their capacity to analyze various issues related to their life and livelihood are being developed. There are four contributing factors found in making the group more effective , they are ; (a) PGO and area managers' effort, (b) socio-economic and gender status of field workers and their acceptance by community people; social awareness (c) the nature of the community, social cohesion and economic homogeneity (d) humanitarian support during and after disaster. Despite all good work been done there are still rooms to improve for better and sustainable outputs which are illustrated below;

2. As the borrowers/ group members are more concerned about financial gain, they are less attentive about social issues and actions. COAST should think about a mechanism by which these members go for social action that affect the poor community or COAST should concentrate on only microfinance.

The review team was informed by group members of that they did not get any training on IGAs. In selecting IGA, they give preference to their own choice & experiences as well as consultation with their spouses. As a result sometime they fail to get appropriate market or price and remain loser. However, in Kutubdia, they said that they get advices regarding cattle, goat and poultry about where to go when their cattle have diseases or become pregnant.

- 3. Review team suggests that should COAST should organise IGA training for group members under micro finance activity or making linkages with the training providing agencies.
- 4. There are trained paravet but he seems less skilled due to this, there is lack of cooperation on the part of the borrowers in IGA regarding the treatment of cattle. Since cattle rearing are an important IGA and the service of Upazila Livestock department is not satisfactory, a well trained paravet who can provide all kinds of services and advices is needed in Kutubdia. COAST can also do some advocacy with local administration to have a supportive livestock officer at upazila level.

Savings withdrawal system of group members don't seem easy as stated by the borrowers. It takes long time to get back saving money.

5. COAST should think of making easy withdrawal system. The lengthy process may create negative impact on the whole microfinance programme of the organisation in the area. As there are so many micro finance institutions working in the same area, the borrowers may leave and join in another group. In a competitive market COAST should think of introducing some flexibility and borrowers friendly system to attract more borrowers. It is note worthy to mention that all members know the system and savings and profit should be informed to the group members when COAST core value is transparency and accountability. COAST should think to remove this grey area.

Training of the Program Organizer (PGO): The micro finance is a very challenging job in a competitive NGO environment. The PGOs are the key to successful microfinance programme. It is observed during our discussion that there is a need for comprehensive training on microfinance and multi dimensional work of COAST. In the micro-credit program, there is unpleasant relationship between PGOs and branch managers, between branch managers and area managers, and between area managers and coordinators. In the lower level, result of which insecurity among the lower level staff seem very high.

6. It is suggested that PGOs be trained on multi dimensional activities of COAST, microfinance as well as human development aspect, Values, relationship, coordination and participatory approach to development. COAST may organise exposure visit and think about a mechanism which will help staff morale and build confidence and develop a sense of mutual respect irrespective of his/her positions.

3.1. Support loan and disaster

After two devastating cyclones; SIDR and AILA the support loan has been distributed to the affected poor people as SAHOS (Special Assistance for housing of SIDR) and RESCUE (rehabilitation of SIDR affected coastal fishery, small business and livestock enterprise) without service charge for "Sidr" and only 4% service charge for AILA. COAST disbursed 4 million for SAHOS and 36 million for RESCUE among 3882 affected families

COAST have been able to mobilise emergency flood restoration and rehabilitation assistance program (EFRRAP) and ultra poor support loan through which taka 2.5 million for EFRRAP and taka 30 million for ultra poor from PKSF to cover 573 and 2363 borrowers respectively.

The above supports have been appreciated by all stakeholders, local administration more over the beneficiaries showed more confidence on COAST. The local administration particularly, the UNO of Bhola lauded the effort of COAST which he has not received from any other NGOs working in that area. He further quoted "COAST is always the first organization who move to the affected areas in spite of their limited resources and keep continuous liaison with the administration."

- ''আমি মনে করি COAST এর কার্যক্রম বিশেষ করে দুর্যোগ কালীন সাহায়তা বিশেষ ভাবে চর এলাকার জনগণ কে তাৎক্ষণিক সাহায্য করেছে যা অতুলনীয় !''- UNO., Bhola.

It revealed from the discussion that NGOs in Bhola don't have sharing, networking between them which is a prerequisite for any development. It helps to bring solidarity, unity as well as make rooms for avoiding duplication of services, He suggested that COAST should take initiative to bring all NGOs working in Bhola and

with the support from local administration. The consultant also found that COAST seems a bit isolated instead of networking,, sharing etc. COAST should also be more transparent about the financial matter as requested by UNO to avoid the ambiguity of the administration .

It is suggested that a power point presentation can be made before them with major line item of budgets but mostly focus on the activities and role of supportive stakeholders.

4. Social Justice Programme

Social justice sector of COAST Trust has been aiming to build alternative power structure/ a pressure group / of the poor at local level for undertaking social issues that affect the community especially the poor people like, demand mediation, organised campaign against unjust, campaign for persuasion of local issues benefit the community at large, create opportunities for accessing to services, etc, and to build capacity of these groups to act and access in these public activity or approach. in order to achieve mentioned goals. The whole concept and objectives of social justice programme sounds very useful and some significant initiatives have been taken on disaster, environment and river transportation in the form of mobilization of civil society and advocacy, etc. The major findings on social justice programmes are;

4.1 People's Organisation

The POs were formed in 1998 though but there has been less attention to these POs from the micro finance group in terms of their roles and responsibilities and plan of action. We were told due to the newly formed POs under MJF funded project, the old POs have been neglected and deprived from the services of COAST. Peoples organizations (Pos) were formed from group officials from microfinance group and from civil society for MJF project. Both groups were visited by the review team and conducted FGDs. The review team found most POs are almost non action oriented and they are not aware about their roles and responsibilities though POs from micro finance group meet every month but couldn't spell out the agenda and resolutions in the meeting book do not give any evidence of the fruitful discussions. All most all respondents have no clear understanding about Jano Sangathan objectives and they also felt that they need more orientation, training, exposure visit and regular discussion for developing their capacity in communication, management, record keeping and information on women rights.

- They do not know about the service providing agencies in Union Parisad and Upazila praised.
- ii) COAST staff responsible for nurturing these groups do not seem aware about the objectives of the formation of POs at different level.
- iii) It appeared from the discussion that some members were not elected / selected on the basis of their skills & knowledge rather availability was given priority.
- Some meeting are not regular and resolution are not being written properly, one of COAST staff checked the resolution book and put some questions and suggestions to write resolution in proper manner even after that, no action been taken by concerned staff and office has also not taken any corrective measure on this.

It was very difficult to find out TOR for PO. In 1998 partial ToR was incorporated in field activities manual and in 2002, a separate guideline was developed but surprisingly, no member of POs could say about it even most COAST staff are not fully aware about it. The evidence prove that some are saying Unit PO some saying Union PO (though this is union based but in guideline the POs area called Unit POs) but no separate guideline found for regional PO activities. The draft field operation manual of 1998 mentioned about some social actions which will be carried out by Unit POs. There are at least 24 social actions stated. It revealed from the discussion with both POs & groups that initiation of establishing POs seem pre mature.

The Structure of jano sangathan (POs);

- i) Chair person
- ii) Vice Chair person
- iii) Secretary
- iv) Secretary financial development
- v) Secretary of cultural
- vi) Secretary of social
- vii) Secretary of political

The monthly meeting of jano sangathan held on 20th in every month. POs have not received any formal training despite they have taken some initiatives in personal and society level which could not even properly proved with evidence.

The members of jano sangathan did not receive any training for their capacity build up

- a) COAST should develop ToR for the POs roles responsibilities and functions. They also need training on their roles, responsibilities and function particularly the social actions.
- b) The also need to know who are the service providers and how to get access to those services. They are ignorant of all these
- c) COAST should think about the selection process of POs some members even don't know their position in POs which is surprising.
- d) If Coast Continues, the POs need to be reorganised and should have an action plan They could be used for;
 - i) Facilitate VGD card to be given to the deserving families
 - ii) They can follow up students allowances and work as watch dog
 - iii) They can have working relations or a MoU with women members of UP in order to solve domestic violence
 - iv) Can work against trafficking
 - v) Can be a very good advocate not to cultivate Tobacco(Tamak) which has spread all over the country as cash crop but the bad effect for both human and land are not being known by the farmers.
 - vi) Group level, union level and upazila level social actions needs to be strengthened further through POs and advocacy activities
 - vii) Surprisingly, the use of manual (very old) is very restricted. It says on the top of the manual that "Can't take this out of the office and photocopy is prohibited". The question arises how POs and group members will know about it and how actions will be undertaken in the field without knowing their roles & responsibilities. We were informed that the staff even can not take it out; they can only read this in the office. This lacks a transparent system in the organisation which needs to be removed immediately.
 - viii) The time has come for COAST to make all documents accessible to all staff as COAST is also advocating for Rights to information(RTI)

4.2. "Model UP" (Strengthen Local Government) under MJF funded project

The review team only visited one "model Union Parisad" as COAST called it. The name of the UP is Usmangonj Union Parisad, Charfasion. The team found couple of up members, member of different committees (non-up members), Chairperson, unfortunately no female members were present. This project is funded by MJF.

The chairperson received training from BARD, secretary received 3 days training and members attended seminar at district level.

No significant achievement was stated except budget preparation using bottom up approach. It appear that open budget may be the step forward to make it a "model"

The consultants were surprised to know that, how this UP could be treated as model? Finally, the chairperson and members as well as standing committee members admitted that this is not yet a "Model UP" compared to other model UPs of the country but the UP is trying to become a model. It appeared that the staff working with UP seem good organiser but lack conceptual understanding about project input and outputs. No planned activities could produced before the review team.

On the other hand, POs (consisting of people from all segment of the society) have very good relation ship with UP and they have initiated a joint monitoring and observation of educational institutes of the upazila but could not produce any report though.

Unfortunately, no female UP members were present nor any women member of any standing committee was also present in the meeting.

The team observed that the UP office is very dirty, unclean as well as toilets are not usable and no running water connection with commode whereas COAST intensively wok with health and sanitation standing committee.

How could COAST justify in excluding standing committee on the prevention of women and children violence? it appeared from an informal discussion that violence against women and children have not reduced significantly and even POs do not have idea where to go for justice beyond UP?

- i) The team strongly recommends that a checklist may be developed with the participation of all stakeholders on what are basic requirement / elements of a model union Parishad
- ii) It is important to activate the standing committees and train them on their roles and responsibilities as well as authority.
- iii) As the standing committee on the Prevention of Violence against Women and Children committee has not been capacitated in the first phase, COAST should keep trying to work with them in order to consolidate the activities so far done.
- iv) The MJF funded project needs to be evaluated based on its indicators and outputs sets in the proposal
- v) All staff as well as all beneficiaries of all project should be trained on how to write a meeting resolution. This has become an urgent need for all programmes of COAST. It very frustrating that the team found most resolutions are not written properly.
- vi) One can easily question about the function of health sanitation standing committee looking at the unclean office building of Model UP. It revealed that the staff responsible for this project at

- local level does not have adequate knowledge about the logical frame work, output indicators of the project. Surprisingly, no female members of UP or any committee could not attend our meeting though the meeting date time was informed earlier. The person should have more training on different development issues, gender in order to discharge her duties properly.
- vii) All concerned UP members, standing committees and POs must know about the project and what is expected from this project.
- viii) Project document should be made available at the project level so that staff could work on the logical frame work. Unfortunately, no plan has been shared with the team based on the log frame. The team asked for the project document but the regional office failed to provide it and the team had to seek assistance from head office through email.
- ix) Both Regional manager and project in-charge must be able to provide all information and should know about project document.
- x) There should have training or coaching/ counselling session from the project in charge in Dhaka for the field level staff in order to better understand the project prior to act on the project.
- xi) All committees, activities, budget, allocations of UP including COAST should be put in the board to make all visible and transparent, Unfortunately, not a single paper, poster or anything was found in the up not even statistical data and social mapping.
- xii) The COAST authority must give serious attention so that the projected goal is achieved timely.
- xiii) Finally, to make a model UP the project staff must acquire knowledge on local government and should have in depth idea about a model UP.. There are so many model UPs in the country .COAST should gather knowledge and information about some UPs funded by LGS-LIC(UNDP/UNCDF) in different places of the country. The most exciting experiences will be to visit SLDGP project of Sirajgonj and Shapara Up of Gaibandha.

4.3. SANGLAP

Praise worthy to note that the programme for the adolescents girls in the most remote and conservative areas definitely have a positive impact on the society at large .

Very shy conservative village adolescents were found very confident and articulate about body changes, problems related menstruation, problems and female diseases which seem great achievement.

The adolescents completed SANGLP have been involved in different IGAs. As stated by the facilitator.

Despite great achievement, there are some deviations noticed by the review team which are stated below with recommendations.

- a) Upazila base network of adolescents may be organised to fight against eve teasing and violence against women . they can be used as change agent ,
- b) Adolescents involved in IGA need training on IGA, Marketing and simple business plan

4.4. Observation of COAST programme on gender perspective

4.4.1 Introduction

Gender is not a single project or program of COAST though but gender has been a cross cutting issues in most projects. It is suggested that COAST may try to mainstream the gender aspect in a planned way.

4.4.2 Board of Trustee

It is observed that there is only one female member in the Board of Trustee. This does not match with the Government rule. The Government of Bangladesh rule is to have at least one third female members in any committee.

a) The COAST management should take a look at the policy of the organisation and try to increase the female members. This would be an ideal situation when you are advocating for equal rights of the women.

4.4.3 Opportunities for female staff

To create gender equality among the project staff the following initiatives need to be taken by the organization:

- i) Educational leave;
- *Ii) Maternity leave;*
- lii)Child care allowance;
- iv)Travel allowance;
- v)Simple work for pregnancy period;
- vi)The branch manager and the area managers are not always supportive to provide the above facilities to the female employees they need to more supportive and gender sensitive
- vii) It is suggested that a unified system need to be introduced considering the above factors and all staff need proper training in order to ensure that gender concept is clear to them.

5. Gender policy

As reported, the existing gender policy has not been implemented properly.

Most staff suggested that COAST need a separate comprehensive gender policy with the participation of all level of male and female staff. Staff further added that;

- a) Comprehensive gender policy is essential;
- b) Gender training (not orientation) should be provided for all staff;
- c) Female staff may be recruited in senior positions in order to ensure gender equality
- d) All staff should have a copy of the gender policy and management should ensure compliances of the policy . It was learnt that 40% staff don't not know about gender policy;

5.1. Gender Concept

Most staff including gender coordinator do not have clear concept about gender issues like positive discrimination. They even could not say about gender sensitivity. The management should give serious attention to make sure all staff understand the gender issue and are gender sensitive in true sense. There should have some indicators in the performance appraisal. It is a general impression of the

country that male staff say they are gender sensitive but in reality the statement is different so time has come to change the attitude and behaviour beyond office premises.

5.2 Gender and MDG

Beside gender, most staff do not have idea about MDGs despite having so may posters, big flip charts were put everywhere in the office building. This is very disappointing for any organisation. This indicates that the staff in charge do not take initiative to discuss all issues among the staff. The posters, flip charts and all other visual materials are being used as for decoration purpose.

- a) The COAST management must make an effort to best use of all informative visual aids. It is to be remembered that if staff don't learn from the available materials how they are going to inform the people they work?
- b) The monitoring staff from Dhaka have not taken any step of checking the use of so many materials displayed in different offices. They should give a try to make staff more knowledgeable skilful and informative.

5.3 Gender Training and Training Manual

This has been observed that despite receiving some gender training, staff mostly the gender coordinator does not have skill, knowledge to provide training to other staff. The manual used in this case can not be treated as training manual rather cut and paste of articles of one NGO.

- a) The team suggests that a core gender team should be developed by providing intensive TOT so that in tern they can make lessons plan, training curriculum and conduct participatory training. Merely lecture methods will have no impact as per adult learning theory is concerned
- b) A manual needs to be developed on the basis of needs. Participatory training is most difficult and important for the facilitator to deliver. So the in house trainer should have all qualities of being a good facilitator with necessary skills and knowledge.

6. Best Practice

There is a risk coverage option for micro finance borrowers. If any borrower died, her family would be exempted to pay rest of the loan amount. And his or her spouse's death loan amount would be adjusted with savings then rest of the loan amount (if any) would be exempted. Despite financial losses, COAST has given fullest sympathy on the humanitarian ground. This is exceptional and praiseworthy.

7. Conclusion

Since inception, COAST has been playing a pioneering role for the development of the poorest people of the coastal areas. This is the only organisation who have been involved both at the coastal areas with different development programmes and national level advocacy that ultimately benefit the coastal people. The role seems quite rational.

Due to the role played by COAST, a momentum has been created at the coastal areas which has been very visible and COAST has earned very good reputation of their dedication towards the development of coastal people particularly poor people. The momentum created due to COAST intervention at coastal areas needs to strengthen further by developing a strategic plan which will give them a proper direction for the next five years and beyond.

Annex- A: Case study

COAST support changes Hasina Begum's life

Hasina Begum a 36 years old women having two children (one daughter and one son) living with her husband in his own house at the embankment of Char Motahar. She has been involved with Karnafuly Samity for more than 15 years. She has good record of saving and timely repayment of loan.

Hisan 's husband is Jamal miah well built and a very hard working man living very happily with his wife and two children. Hasina's husband had no place to live and he bought the possession of half acre of land in the embankment with Tk. 7000 where he built one tin shed house, kitchen and a shed for cows. They have a kitchen garden which gives them necessary nutrition for the family and also earned money by selling surplus vegetables.

Hasina and Jamal are a good planner

Besides weekly savings to the samity, both Hasina nad Jamal made a long term plan that they will save money and one day they will have their own house and land. Besides their own house and land, Hasina took Tk. 15000 loan one year back from karnafuly samity supported by COAST and add their savings Tk, 70000 together to buy a shallow machine. As the people of that area started cultivating water melon, it needs irrigation including for paddy field. Hasina's Husband now fully engaged in irrigating others land. He works day and night. By this time he also lerant how to repair the shallow machine During irrigation season, Jamal earns 7000-1000 taka in month. The clever planning changed their life and are a happy couple.

Significant changes in their life

They have two children and are not willing to take any more children because they learn two children make a family happy. Hasina's son is studying now in BRAC school in class-I, the daughter is still minor and hasina 's aim is to send her daughter to school too. The important changes of attitude to notice that most children living in this community help their parents to earn their livelihood wheras, Hasiana and Jamal think that if their children can be educated, they will not have the same fate like Hasian and Jamal.

As soon as irrigation period is over, Jamal go to the river for fishing so that his hard earned money is not spent sitting home idle.

Good planning can change the life if they have a shared vision.

Annex- B

COAST Trust

Field Visit Plan : External Review Team

Date	Place	Time	Stakeholder	Issue	Responsi ble person
20.02.10	Start for Bhola :	Reach at Sada	Aminul Hoque		
21.02.10 Sunday	I	9.00-10.00		Arrival and Rest	Al Amin
Charfassion		11.00-100	Meeting with local staff	Organization program, management and governance	Maksud
		3.00- 4.00	PO	Institution Building and role of alternative power structure	Al Amin
		4.00- 5.00	MF group organized (year 84, 2000, 2005 and new)	Consultant issues: Impact of MF, MFTS, Dev Education	Maksud
		4.30- 5.30	Meting with CSO	COAST Program and Intervention	Al Amin
22.02.10 Monday	Char Motahar	10.00-11.00	MF group (2001-2005)	Impact MF, health, DE	B. Debnath
		12.00-1.00	PO	Institution Building and role of alternative power structure	B. Deb/Al Amin
	Charfassion	4.30-5.30	UP chairman /member	Institutional Dev of LG and Interaction with PO	Al Amin
		6.00-8.00	Govt. official UNO, TEO	COAST Program and Intervention	Al Amin
23.02.10 Tuesday	Charfassion	9.00.12.00	- MF Group (Old) - Selected Beneficiaries	- Impact of MF, MFTS, Dev Education - Case Study	Maksud

COAST Trust Field Visit Plan: External Review Team at Cox's Bazar

Date	Place	Time	Stakeholders	Issue	Responsible person
08.03.10 Monday	Start for CxB :	Reach at Kalab	pagan by 8.00 am a	at least	Aminul Hoque
09.03.10 Tuesday		9.00 -1.00	Field Visit	MF Impact, ME	Barekul Islam
CxB Sadar		3.00 - 6.00	Meeting with local staff	Organization program, management and governance	Moqbul Bhai
		7.00 - 8.30	Meting with CSO	COAST Program and Intervention	Alam Bhai
10.03.10 Wednesday	Kutubdia	10.00-11.00	MF group (2001-2005)	Impact MF, health, DE	AM
		12.00 – 1.00	Govt. official UNO, TSWO	COAST Program and Intervention	Alam Bhai
		1.00-2.00	Lunch		
		3.00- 5.00	SHO & VDC	Impact of asset transfer and role of alternative power structure	Munir
	Chakoria	9.00 – 1.00	Field Visit Farida Apa	Program and Gender	AM
11.03.10 Thursday	MK / Ukiah	10.00.12.00	- SF Education	- Impact of Education - Case Study	Salim Khan
		12.00.1.00	- ME	- Impact of MF with Indigenous people - Case Study	AM
		1.00 - 2.00	Lunch		
		3.00 – 4.00	PO/GoB officials	Role of alternative power structure/ COAST Program and Intervention	Alam Bhai
		4.30pm	- Return to CMTC		
12.03.10 Friday		Return to Dha	ka, start at 9.00 am	1	Aminul Hoque

Annex-C: Work Sheet used for conducting Exercise with Coast Staff

Internal Factors	Strength	Weakness	Strategy to Improve / Address
			Weaknesses
Staff Competency			
Knowledge & Skills			
Commitments			
Staff Development process			
Staff Drop-out			
Benefit & welfare			
Staff Satisfaction			
Organizational Structure		T	
Organizational Structure			
Project Organogram			
Male-female ratio in senior			
management			
Planning Process			
Bottom-up Planning Staff Participation			
Stakeholders Participation Decision making			
			T
সিদ্ধান্ত গ্রহণে স্টাফদের অংসগ্রহণ এবং			
প্রক্রিয়া			
পরিকল্পনা প্রক্রিয়ায় উপকারভোগীদের			
অংশগ্ৰহন			
Management Practices		T	
Practice of Policies			
সকল Policy সঠিকভাবে প্রয়ৌগ			
হয় (নাম করুন)			
<u>Meetings</u>			
সকল মিটিং সঠিক সময়ে হয়			
এবং লিপিবদ্ধ প্রতিবেদেন			
সঠিক সময়ে সবার কাছে			
*			
পৌছে			
Team building			
Team building এর অবস্থা			
Information Sharing			
সঠিক সময়ে সকল স্তরে			
তখ্য আদান প্রদান এর ব্যবস্থা			
Work Planning			
সকলেই কর্ম পরিকল্পনা			
করে তা অনুমোদন এর পর সেই কর্ম			
পরিকল্পনা অনুযায়ী মনিটরিং করা হয়			
এবং রিপোর্ট করা হয়			
Monitoring &			
<u>evaluation</u>			
১. মনিটরিং এর জন্য আলাদা			
বিভাগ আছে এবং তা কার্যকরী			
াসভাগ আখে এবং ৩। কাশকরা			
২. মনিটরিং tools আছে এবং ভা			
সঠিক ভাবে সর্বদা ব্যবহার করা হয়			

Delegation of authority and responsibility					
Managerial authority					
বিভিন্ন পর্যায়ের মানেজারদের সিদ্ধান্ত গ্রহনের স্ক্রমতা					
, ,					
(যেমন: অর্থনৈতিক, কর্মী মূল্যায়ন , নিযোগ)					
Accountability and Transpare	nnov.				
श्वानीय भर्यास्य भव्यनाती , श्वश्वानिक এवः	ilicy				
I -					
সহকারী উপকারভোগী , ও					
অন্যান্য দের কাছে সচ্ছতা ও দায়বদ্ধতা					
Internal Coordination		<u> </u>			
এই এলাকার সকল কর্মসূচির মধ্যে কার্যকরি					
সমল্ল্য এর অবস্থা					
Record Keeping					
Faadhaal, waadhaa'aa					
Feedback mechanism					
Inter-project Coordination					
External coordination					
বিভিন্ন পর্যায়ের সংগঠন তথা					
সরকারী , বেসরকারী এবং নাগরিক					
সমাজের সাথে সমন্ন্রয়					
Policies of organization					
Service rule, Personnel policy, staff					
development Policy					
সকেলই জানেন এবং					
সকলের কাছে কপি আছে					